

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF COUNCIL

CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS, OHIO

Monday, March 8, 2010

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 7:00 p.m. by President Frank J. Geraci, Jr.

INVOCATION BY: Councilwoman Debra Sarnowski

ROLL CALL: **PRESENT:** President Frank J. Geraci, Jr.
Council Members Marincic, Nenadovich,
Sarnowski, Suster, Vaughn

EXCUSED: Dudley, Mahoney

CLMN SUSTER: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to make a motion to excuse Councilman Dudley this evening.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Roll call.

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

CLMN SUSTER: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to make a motion we excuse Councilperson Mahoney this evening.

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes.

READING AND DISPOSAL OF MINUTES:

Moved by Clmn SUSTER to accept the minutes of the Regular Meeting of City Council of February 22, 2010 as submitted. The minutes were adopted with five YES votes and two ABSENT votes.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS TO COUNCIL: None.

LEGISLATION OUT OF COMMITTEE: None.

REPORTS OF THE MAYOR AND DIRECTORS:

PRESIDENT GERACI: We will go on to the reports of the Mayor and the Directors. Mayor Collova, do you have a report?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Yes, Sir. Thank you, Mr. Geraci and Council. First off I want to talk about a new program that started tonight. This program is, if you notice at the podium here, we have two young ladies. These are students from Garfield Heights High School. They're going to be a part of this Council Meeting from here on in. What we're doing is we're trying to put together the schools and the city because we're working as one and the city and we're bringing them on just as Directors to give reports about what's going on in the city. If you would like to ask them a question, by all means please do. We have Nikki Coyle and we have Joanna Maslocha and these are Seniors from Garfield Heights and they have been

selected because of their merits, I would assume. They have their principal here, Mr. O, in the back that's grading them so this ought to work out pretty good. So when everybody here starts beating me up today please watch your language. Thank you.

I want to talk a little bit about something good that I think is coming around the corner in Garfield Heights. That is we had a meeting from the County Library this week. They are proposing to Garfield Heights to put a new library in. A new library in at their expense. Presently we have a library next door here that is 12,000 square feet. The library that they're proposing is a state-of-the-art library. It's going to be 30,000 square feet. It's going to have multiple meeting rooms to be used for civic use, computer labs, training centers, homework centers for the students. We were really excited about this coming up. We have to iron out a few legalities. We believe this is going to take place in 2011. So we're certainly looking forward to that.

The next item I want to talk a little bit about is it seemed like every Council Meeting I talked a little bit about the convention center that was scheduled into the City View shopping center. Each meeting I seemed to have a different response for you and I think I finally got a final response. That response is the convention center is not coming into City View. I want to talk a little bit about that because I think it's important for everybody to understand why this took place or at least why I believe it took place. First off, this convention center was going to bring thousands of people into City View and it would have really changed the face of City View. We were really excited about that. It wasn't going to bring in a whole lot of dollars to the city but what it was going to do was really help out the other vendors and businesses there and Giant Eagle and AJ Wright in their lease have the right, to my understanding although I have not read the lease, but my understanding is they have the right if a non-retail business comes into the center they have a right to accept or refuse. Now my understanding is that AJ Wright agreed to bring them in and thought it was a great idea. Giant Eagle thought differently.

Before I get into why I think they did and what I think we should do, I want to read you something. This notice was put together by the manager or I should say owner of the convention center. He talked about some of the things that this would do for City View and Garfield Heights. He was working with the store manager of Giant Eagle at City View Plaza to supply the food for the concession stands. He agreed that all the food from the concession stands would be bought from Giant Eagle. He was also partnered up with US Bank which was located in Giant Eagle to handle all of his banking. The convention center had set up its merchant services account with US Bank also at City View Plaza. The convention center had partnered with Office Max at the City View Plaza to be the business center for all the vendors and event promoters as well as the center itself. The convention center has partnered with Ruby Tuesday at the City View Plaza to be the official caterer for all events, promoters, functions, further Ruby Tuesday is offering special lunch discounts to all vendors of events at the Convention Center. The Convention Center had also partnered with Applebee's at City View to host the happy hour functions for each event that came in. They also partnered up with Qdoba for all the Hispanic business that came in. They were going to do the catering for that. The convention center had also partnered with Starbucks at City View Plaza for coffee and pastry. The convention center was going to get their work from Legacy Staffing at City View for the part-time work that would come in and work the shows when they needed the additional help. Even the Garfield Heights Chamber of Commerce had talked about moving in to that location. These are some of the things that were going to go on.

Now I'm going to take a minute to talk to you a little bit about the projected dollars that were going to come into City View. The convention center would have hosted between 20 and 30 consumer events in 2010. The combined events would draw in excess of 50,000 consumers to the City View Plaza. The National Association of Expositions states that each consumer spends an average of \$33.00 at a consumer event and its surrounding areas. That translates to \$1,650,000.00 would have been spent with City View merchants in one year. The convention center would have hosted 3,000 event exhibitors at the events scheduled in 2010. The average exhibitor spending a weekend away at an event spends \$385.00 in local establishments. That translates to \$1,155,000.00 spent at local area establishments. The vendors that exhibit at these events will rent 2,000 hotel rooms in the Garfield Heights vicinity. Approximate rate of the rooms \$82.00 each which

translates into approximately \$175,000.00 for the hotel rooms. This is what the projections were. I don't know. I certainly didn't do these projections and I don't know how accurate they are but they don't sound too far out of the ball park to me. This is what was expected to happen if Giant Eagle said OK.

Giant Eagle did not say OK. They said that they felt that the convention center wasn't the type of business that was good for a mall like that. I talked to Giant Eagle personally. I talked to the person that was involved in the charge of these negotiations and I said someday you're going to have to explain to me how an empty Wal-Mart store does better than having a convention center that's going to bring thousands of people. She couldn't really answer that, but I don't know if anybody can answer that. What happened was the city of Garfield Heights we lost out greatly on this. Everywhere I went people asked me about that convention center about what was going on in City View and I was very proud to report that we had the convention center coming in. It was going to open some doors for us. Even in my far out dreams I was seeing that things were going to start opening up and maybe that road would go through and we could start getting some things done over there. Well this certainly put a stop to it. I am really open for suggestions and I've been talking to people. Part of the reason I brought this up publicly today and I know Giant Eagle isn't going to be happy. I'm not here to chastise Giant Eagle. I'm not here to cause a boycott of Giant Eagle. They're a business in Garfield Heights. The participation they get from our residents and everybody else is huge. I don't want to do a boycott which is going to hurt their store and it's going to hurt us. So that's not what I'm trying to do. What I do want to do is I want to let them know how unpleasant this is because I wouldn't like to see the same thing happen if another business comes to town and we have to say mother may I to Giant Eagle. I think they are wrong for what they did and I don't know the reason. Maybe they did have a great business reason but they certainly didn't convey it to me--the Receiver and Giant Eagle that were in talks. I was not privy to those talks. They did not invite me to the meetings. It was something done between the two groups. So if anybody has any ideas later on, if you want to get on the mike and ask me or if you want to call my office or something, I think we need to let Giant Eagle be aware of what's going on. The other reason that I wanted to make this public was for the people that have come to the meetings every month, I know since I've been in office I've been talking about the convention center and doing everything I can to make it happen. I was very excited about it. The word that got out to some of the shows that got canceled was the Mayor stopped them from coming in. I just want everybody to understand what really happened although I don't know the details and I certainly don't want to blame one person over the other. I hate to throw stones at Giant Eagle because they are a good business for us here in Garfield Heights, but everything points to them. I wish they could come out and explain to us why they did what they did because it really hurt our community. So I'm open for any ideas about that and we'll move on down the road from there.

Last meeting I gave a talk about the finances in Garfield Heights and why legislation was put up for the rubbish. I know many of you were here and heard that but we have a lot of new people that are here or many new people that are here. We've had many people making phone calls and asking some questions and I want to relay again why we did what we did and how we got to this position so bear with me for a few minutes because I think it's important. For those of you that have been here every week you can go get a drink of water or something. About a year ago the city of Garfield Heights was put into fiscal emergency by the State. We were approximately probably \$4 million to \$4.5 million in deficit. Some of the things that were done by the previous administration and continued on when I got into office were we had staff reductions. We had people that took buyouts. We had people that left and were not replaced and the amount of money that we saved was \$1.4 million in staff reductions. We also had give backs from the employees--wages and benefits. The staff gave back in wages and benefits \$770,000.00. Our staff took a 40% cut in pay. I want to you to think about it for those of you who were in the work force, what a 40% cut in pay, how often you've ever taken a 40% cut in pay. I've heard of 10. I've heard of 15. This was 40%. In the paper yesterday there was an article about Ohio trims the payroll by 1.5%. They talked about that the payroll was trimmed by 1.5% and that was wrong. They should have trimmed the payroll by 4.3%. 4.3% is what the private sector has averaged on trimming the payrolls. Garfield Heights trimmed 40%. That's the amount that our people have given back from our staff. Additionally to have given back \$770,000.00. There was another (I don't even know the numbers) but they changed from a Cadillac medical plan to a Pinto. That's what they got, Many people have

done that. It's not something that they did drastically, but it was a cut. Before they didn't have that. They had the best there was and they took a big drop back to get that. Additionally, we saved \$75,000.00 in admin fees from Medical Mutual. We got \$75,000.00 off of our yearly medical payments. We no longer have an architect on retainer. We saved \$30,000.00. We put an Assistant Law Director on to stop using outside counsel for an approximate \$70,000.00 per year savings. In the past we went to outside counsel and paid \$250.00 to \$275.00 an hour and they did everything—negotiations, etc. Right now we're doing everything in-house. So I added a Law Director and that addition saved approximately \$70,000.00 and the way the lawsuits keep rocking in it could be more than that. We are in the process of changing our engineering practices. Those practices will save us approximately \$125,000.00 a year. We have been working with the Court. The Court has trimmed their staff. They've trimmed their payroll. They're going to report to me exactly in dollars how much that is and that's going to be a substantial savings. As many of you know, and I know you're not happy, but we ceased the Senior snow plowing. Senior snow plowing cost the city \$72,000.00 a year. Presently we're working with numerous vendors' contracts and we're renegotiating as we speak with those contracts and I'd say 95% of the time we've been able to negotiate for a lesser price. These are things that are going in place, are in place and have taken place since December 1st.

After all that we're still about \$1.4 million in deficit. There is no way to get that \$1.4 million by the time we need it because of the State. We have to report to the State our Plan for the city and it has to be done, it was supposed to be done by the end of March. They're giving us till the end of April because they need to know what's going on with this rubbish thing. Now we had three choices to make up this \$1.4 million deficit. We could have charged for the rubbish fee, which legislation has been put up to do that. We could have done something with the taxes, increase taxes, or we could have simply took layoffs. I said this last week and I will say it again. This Council and myself and the Administration could have taken the easy way out and the easy way out would have been to do nothing at all. To tell each and every one of you that are here tonight, that are asking us not to do this, to tell you know what, you're right we're not going to do it because you don't want us to. The State would then come in and lay off. It would force us to lay off approximately 35 people or 15% of the work force, including police and firemen. That's the third option. Layoff police and fire and service. That's something that we don't want to do in the city. Not only this city--any city--and it's happening all around. You see what's going on. This Council didn't want to just sit back and let the State do it and take the easy way out. What they did they did as leaders. They said this is what we need to get this city rebounded again. There's not one of us not me or anybody on Council especially myself to be in office for 90 days to tell the people that put me there guess what? You're going to be charged for rubbish, ha ha. That's not something I want to do. It's not something I could be proud of. I feel bad about it. So does everybody on this Council. The key to this thing is we have no choice. We have to make up this deficit or we will not make payroll

Everybody heard what happened in Ashtabula. That tough snowstorm. They closed he doors on Friday at three o'clock. Never plowed again till Sunday at midnight. You know how stacked this place would be if we would have done that? I'd have had every resident in the world here still trying to dig out from the snow. Cities are doing some pretty strange things right now because they have to. it's an unbelievable situation when your talking about finances. I've asked people what can we do? You heard all the steps we took. We've been above and beyond what many cities have taken. And my door's open all the time to hear if anybody has any suggestions. I'm willing to listen, but you have to understand we have to have this done by April. Today I was in Mr. Obert's office with the State and they're in there telling me are you sure this is going to be passed? I want to know when you're going to get this money. It's not like a State meeting that we have. I told her you come into these closed doors and you tell me what I have to do then we have a State meeting and you act like everything's nice and smooth. Believe me our backs are against the wall. We don't have a whole lot of choice. Some of the other communities that are charging for rubbish are Fairview Park, Parma Heights. They either charge or are in the process like we are of putting legislation up. Olmsted Falls, Euclid, Bay Village, Gates Mills, Lyndhurst and Maple Heights and there are some others. These are the only ones that I had reported to me through the County. It's a terrible situation. I don't see any way around it.

I know that there's some people here that won't be able to get medicine because they have to pay an extra \$15.00 or \$10.00 for rubbish depending on your age. What we have done and Noreen's going to get into it for the people that their backs are really against the wall and I understand it. Not just the people that don't want to pay any more taxes or rubbish but the people that really can't afford it we're going to find a way for you to get some help and we're going to do that through some of the assisted programs. I want to tell you something folks, in this day and age when times are as bad as they are, do not be too proud to ask for help. If you need help ask for it, because you're not alone. A lot of people do. But this is the reason that it's on the floor. This is the reason we did it. We didn't do this on a whim. We didn't do this as many people are reporting on their Websites just to pull something out of the air. We put a lot of thought into this. We put in a lot of research. We sat down with State. We sat down with other communities. We looked at every aspect of it. There is no other way to go. So with that said, Mr. Chairman, you have my report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mayor Collova. Any questions for Mayor Collova, Council?

CLWN MARINCIC: Mayor, I had a resident call me today and say why won't we put a restriction of years on the piece to charge for trash collection?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I've heard that too from somebody. I'm glad you brought that up, Nancy. We have agreed in this legislation to put something in there that says it will be reviewed each year. I know there's a lot of you here that don't know me. We have all heard, for our entire lives that when somebody says they're going to take a tax away it never happens and I know that as well as you do. I'm telling you as sure as I'm sitting here that when we get back into the black and we have this money and I believe we'll be there and we'll be there in a pretty good time frame, you will get this back. Now can I guarantee years on that? I don't know how we can guarantee years to be honest with you. I'm telling you that this Council first of all this Council won't let me keep this money when it's no longer needed for this immediate emergency so I'm telling you that it will be taken away.

CLWN MARINCIC: Are we renting the Civic Center rooms again? I thought we weren't going to do that?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: We are doing that. What we did is we increased the cost of the meeting rooms. We've dropped down the staff and we're looking at ways to make money at this. It's all about bringing in dollars into the city.

CLWN MARINCIC: OK. So the fact that we are renting the rooms again is not costing the city any money? We are making money on it now?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: First off, we never stopped actually renting them. What we did is we carried it through from last year. Last year we lost money at this but I don't think it was managed properly. I think under proper management we can make money and even if we don't make money, we just break even, I'm happy because it didn't cost the city money and our residents have an opportunity to use that hall.

CLWN MARINCIC: OK. Thank you, Mayor.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: You're welcome.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions from the Council? If not, we'll move on. City Law Director Mr. Riley.

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: No report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any questions for Mr. Riley? If not we'll move on. Service Director Mr. McLaughlin.

SERVICE DIRECTOR TIM McLAUGHLIN: Thank you, Mr. President. I'd like to give the salt report. Last year at this time we used 3,589 tons of salt and there was 76" of snow. So far this year we've used 3,758 tons of salt and there's 64" of snow. The crews are out and will continue to stay out. I have everybody that's available out on the road with the cold patch. Since January 1st we've used 56 tons of cold patch. Sometimes it's a rough thing to keep going in and filling the same holes again and again. That's what we have to

continue to do until the hot patch plants open. Try and find out when they're going to be open most of the time. One of them will open some time in April. I have some calls in to find out when they're going to be open for more permanent repairs. Today we stuck the sweeper out. Tried to get up some of the asphalt; some of the stuff that's on the streets and we'll continue to send it out. That's the end of my report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. McLaughlin. Any questions for Mr. McLaughlin?

CLWN SARNOWSKI: Going back to when the Water Department comes and fixes a leak on the street and they have to tear up the street, who is responsible for taking care of the street? Do you wait till we repair the street?

SERVICE DIRECTOR TIM McLAUGHLIN: They don't come back to repair the street. We repair the street. I'm not sure we have about 50 of them that are open right now and now all we can do is cold patch because there's no hot patch to do a permanent fix on them. I'd say by the middle of summer or fall it will be done. It just depends on how many we end up with. There were six new ones this week and I'm sure it's not over with yet. We do all the repairs so we know they are done right. Then Cleveland reimburses us in October I think.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions?

CLMN SUSTER: Is there any way that we could or we have the equipment to do crack sealing?

SERVICE DIRECTOR TIM McLAUGHLIN: We have no equipment to do crack sealing.

CLMN SUSTER: Because I know not only are we getting the potholes but a lot of streets have cracks that have formed that are getting deeper. I don't think the patch is going to work on the cracks.

SERVICE DIRECTOR TIM McLAUGHLIN: We have no crack sealing anyhow. They could put cold crack sealer on there but it's not going to stay. As long as you have freeze and thaw you're going to be fighting a tough battle.

CLMN SUSTER: Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions? Recreation Director Mr. Bob Dobies.

PARKS AND RECREATION DIRECTOR BOB DOBIES: Mr. President and Council Members, good evening. A few things this evening. T-ball registrations are being taken during the month of March. Softball signup started last Friday and Saturday and again will be held March 12th and 13th. That's Friday and Saturday at the Rec Center from 6:30 to 8:30 on Friday and from 10:00 a.m. to 2 p.m. on Saturday. Hockey Booster club will be taking our youth icers to Washington, D.C. this weekend to participate in the National Cup Tournament. On behalf of the city I'd like to wish them the best of luck. Although the sun is shining and that's a good thing, the Kostel Recreation Center will be hosting another hockey tournament this weekend. It's hockey time. We spent two weeks trying to negotiate this thing and it came to be. This weekend we'll hold the Rock 'n Roll Cup Tournament Series. Participation is at various levels of competition. We'd like to welcome all the participants to our facility and city.

Last the Recreation Center will be enjoying the company of our Senior Walking Club which is just established, for the first time tomorrow. If anybody else is interested as a resident in walking during the inclement weather, please feel free to come and join us during the open session which is from 10:00 in the morning till 2:30 in the afternoon. One last thing I'd just like to recognize, as a School Board member, our two new Council people our high school students. I'm very proud of you for taking part in tonight's Council Meeting. Thank you. That concludes my report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Dobies. Any questions for Mr. Dobies? Finance Director, Mr. Obert.

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: No report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any questions for Mr. Obert? Economic Development, Ms. Kuban.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR NOREEN KUBAN: Thank you, Mr. President. Resolutions number 10 and 11 are for the appointment of two residents to serve on our Tax Incentive Review Council. The TIRC meets annually to review all tax abatement agreements in effect. Resolution 13 is to apply for grant funding for the improvement of playgrounds. It's for a grant of \$35,000.00. There's no city match and that is with the County Department of Development. Resolution 14 is also with the County Department of Development and that's to apply for a \$5,000.00 grant to start community gardens within this city. That also does not have a city match. Next I have the County Department of Development is starting their annual funding for the Store Front Improvement Program. I have descriptions and applications. If you could pass that down I'd appreciate that. I'll give one to the Neighborhood News so she can put it in the newspaper.

Also the County is restarting the Senior Safety Program. It was the Slip and Fall Program. It's to make improvements to houses of Senior citizens ages 62 or older to make it safe so the people can stay in their houses longer. We were a pilot program a couple of years ago and I've been getting calls about the program so they have restarted it. I know the Mayor had mentioned comments about people who are unable to afford some of the rubbish fee. If you're having any issues, particularly Seniors, we have a social worker on staff. The County has a program called Benefits Checkup and our social worker can make an appointment and meet with you. You can come in my office and have a computer program and they can go through to see what benefits are available to you and your family. That concludes my report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Ms. Kuban. Any questions for Ms. Kuban? Building Commissioner Mr. Wervey.

BUILDING COMMISSIONER BILL WERVEY: No report.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any questions for Mr. Wervey? If not we'll move on. I neglected to notice the two students from Garfield Heights. In regards to introducing the two. Nicole Coyle and Joanna Maslocha. You're on. Give us your report.

Miss Nicole Coyle: This past weekend Showboat was hosted by SOS which is basically like our talent show which is a fundraiser for St. Jude. It was last Friday. We raised approximately \$1,000.00. Our basketball team won this weekend in a tournament with a score of 59-57. If they win three more games they can go to the championship. They are ranked 16th in the area and their record is 15-7. Our band went to critique this weekend and were rated a three which is average.

Miss Joanna Maslocha: This Thursday CVC will be hosting a job fair for students to find work for over the summer. It's from 3:30 to 6:30. Our academic team will be airing on TV this Saturday on Channel 5 at 7 p.m. so watch that academic team. On March 26th our last blood drive will be held at the high school and we're trying to break a record of 90 pints and it's chaired by me and Napree Saunderson. Thank You.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Any there any questions for the students?

CLWN SARNOWSKI: You mentioned this SOS System of Services. Can you explain about that and what kind of group that is?

MISS MASLOCHA: System of Services is a community service organization at the high school where we run projects such as K-3 Carnival, Winterfest Dance, Showboat and we host the blood drives. K-3 Carnival is a Halloween alternative for the younger kids to come instead of going out for trick or treating. The Winterfest Dance is for the multi-handicapped students to come from all around and come to the school and have a nice dance rhythm, because they usually don't go to their school dances.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions?

CLWN SARNOWSKI: And these are all volunteers? It's not a class or anything? It's all volunteer students who do it on their own?

MISS MASLOCHA: There's a class for it. If you're in the class this group actually runs the project. But for the community service organizations it's all the volunteers that help put on the project.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions?

CLWN MARINCIC: What time was the blood drive and where was it at?

MISS MASLOCHA: It's at the high school. It's from 8 in the morning till 3 o'clock.

CLWN MARINCIC: What day?

MISS MASLOCHA: On Friday, March 26th.

CLWN MARINCIC: What do you think of the new superintendent? You got any dirt on her yet?

MISS MASLOCHA: No.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any other questions? I hope not. I want to personally thank Nicole and Joanna. You did an excellent job for the first time. As a matter of fact you did a better job than I did. I compliment you. Thank you for coming and we'll move on.

COMMENTS BY CITIZENS:

PRESIDENT GERACI: Now we'll go on to Comments from the Citizens On The Agenda only. The rules are this portion of the meeting is for the residents' comments on legislation only. Comments are limited to five minutes. No one can speak more than once. Please raise you hand to be recognized.

David Mays, 8250 Green Drive. Resolution 10-2010 and 11-2010. Is this costing the city any money? With these people being appointed?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR NOREEN KUBAN: No. This is an annual review. They do not get paid.

MR. MAYS: Thank you. Ordinance 12-2010. Is this supposed to read cats permitted in the city or in the home in Garfield?

CLWN MARINCIC: Cats permitted within the city of Garfield Heights per household. Good catch.

MR. MAYS: OK. That would be as permitted in the homes, not in the city itself?

CLWN MARINCIC: Thank you very much. That would clarify it. Yes.

MR. MAYS: OK. Thank you. Mayor, you know how I feel about Resolution 13-2010. I still would like to see that amended to state that when the city does not need the money to get us out of hock that it will be taken away—the garbage charge.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Mr. Mays, if I had any idea, if I had a crystal ball to tell me when the city was going to be back in the black I'd love to give you a date.

MR. MAYS: I didn't ask you for a date. I said I would like to see it put in that when the city is no longer in need of the money, that there's no emergency, that it will be taken out. Whether you are here or the rest of Council is here. I asked that last meeting and it still hasn't been done. It's not that I don't believe you, but I don't believe a lot of people.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I can understand that totally.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you.

Steve Prokay, 9801 Sladden Avenue. The first thing I want to mention is please I don't know what the Mayor and you people understand but I understand you have a rough job. As a matter of fact our President of the United States has a rough job. There's people out there without insurance that have to make crisis decisions and he's trying to make one, but I adore every one of you guys for what you have to do. The first thing I bring up is please make your legislation exempt for people on disability and the disabled Veterans. How many units of insulin am I going to take? I need 60 twice a day. Am I just going to take 30 twice daily to pay for

the rubbish pickup that we've never paid for if I can quote from The Plain Dealer. Garfield Heights people that lived in the city back in 1970 was 31,000. In 2008 this paper says this is data control 27,734. The past Administration I blame for everything that we have to do tonight. Somebody had to see this. Somebody had to see that the day of reckoning was going to come, but they didn't and blaming them does no good. You guys have a hell of a job to do. Let's do it in a fashion where we get the community involved. This room should be packed. We should be using a bigger facility. Don't leave it up to just all you people. Let the whole city get involved with it.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Mr. Prokay, speak into the microphone, please.

MR. PROKAY: I'm sorry. The Mayor doesn't have to.

PRESIDENT GERACI: You're running out of time.

MR. PROKAY: OK, some things you said you sound like Art Modell. Art Modell said we're never going to leave the city. Not that I don't trust you. It has nothing to do with it. But because that's not in the legislation it should be put in there so that when you do get into the black that we do rescind this tax and over forty years we've never had a tax for picking up garbage in this community. Why now? If you have to get that by April, why can you put like Linndale did a speed trap on 480? It's for the people that break the law that should have to pay. They were noted for having a speed trap and still have it today. God knows how much money they make.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Mr. Prokay, could you wind it up?

MR. PROKAY: OK. And you talk about money and funds. I have some ideas that I'd be glad to get with you to save this money by April. One is taking the Recreation Director and eliminating the Service Director's position and the three foremen you have. Police department. Sixteen police. You know how big our community is? 7.31 miles. North Royalton is twice that size and they have less the force. I hate to see police cut especially like my Council lady was telling me crime is up but let's take a look at that. Let's take a look at these cuts. Don't stop what you're doing now. It's good, but don't let the citizens bail out Garfield Heights. Don't be like General Motors.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you.

Mildred Whitmore , 13154 Forestdale Drive. I'd like to know how did you all come up with the \$15.00 per home and the \$10.00 for Senior citizens on Homestead?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: We checked some of the other cities and tried to get an average of what the other cities were doing in the surrounding areas and those were the numbers we came up with. What was the average.

MS. WHITMORE: Do you know most of these homes has families in them? They put out a lot of garbage. Most of these people on Homestead are disabled, Seniors. They don't put out a lot of garbage. They only have one or two people in the house and they're old. We going to pay \$10.00. Here's a family going to pay \$15.00 and you got a lot of Section 8 families in Cleveland. You got two-family homes. What you going to charge the two families? Have you thought of that?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: We thought about everything you said.

MS. WHITMORE: Will you charge the two families \$15.00?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Yes, we are.

MS. WHITMORE: That's not fair.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: There was discussion about how it should be done. There was many ideas on how to charge for the rubbish.

MS. WHITMORE: That's not what I was told. If you charge a two-family home \$15.00 and you going to charge a single family home \$15.00.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: It's \$15.00. \$10.00 for Seniors. \$15.00 for not Seniors. That's what the charge for the rubbish is. Per dwelling.

MS. WHITMORE; So on a two-family home you're going to charge them \$30.00?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: No, ma'am.

MS. WHITMORE: That's not fair. They say one thing and you say another one.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Let's see what the legislation says. Mr. Law Director, you're in charge.

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: It's going to be charged per household. It's \$15.00 per household. If you have a Homestead exemption it's \$10.00.

MS. WHITMORE; If you have a two-family home, how much you going to pay?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: \$15.00.

MS. WHITMORE; That's not right.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: As I said, there's not a right or a wrong to this thing. There was many suggestions. Some suggestions said I only have one bag of rubbish. The house next to me has six kids. They have eight bags of rubbish. How would you determine that? Can you give me an idea of how you'd determine that?

MS. WHITMORE: I didn't ask about kids or how many in the family. I asked if there's a two-family home. You got two families in that home and you're going to tell us it's \$15.00. I'm one and you're going to charge me \$10.00. Or you going to charge somebody else \$15.00 just for a single home.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Usually the owner of the home whether he owns up and down is one owner.

MS. WHITMORE: It's still a two-family home.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: This was discussed. I have no problem if Council wants it to be amended and you want to charge \$30.00 that's more money for the city.

MS. WHITMORE: That's what I'm asking. How did you come up with this? Seems like you should. It don't make sense.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: If Council wants to amend this to \$30.00 would that make more sense to you?

MS. WHITMORE: Yes.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: If Council wants to do that we'll do that next meeting.

MS. WHITMORE: I'm one. I got to pay \$10.00. You got a family in a home that's only paying \$15.00.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I think its an excellent idea. We'll discuss it.

MS. WHITMOR: I don't.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I'm talking about an excellent idea about the two families.

MS. WHITMORE: Oh, well. Think about it.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Thanks.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thanks. Anybody else?

Piccolo Mini, 9412 Grand Division. Good evening Mr. Mayor, Council. I'm here to talk about Ordinance 12-2010. The adoption of animals and codified ordinance of the city. If anyone on Council is interested I am an animal activist as most of you know and I do have names and numbers for residents who will need to have their animals fixed and a lot of these services come free. So if any of you have residents that are calling about their cats, they can't afford to get them spayed or neutered, please contact me, I'll put them in touch with whoever they need to be in touch with and make that happen.

Next would be of course, sorry but the rubbish collection. I was a little reluctant but after hearing more of what you've discussed here tonight we have no choice but to support our Mayor and our Council. That's all we can do. We have to support our city. This is where we live. It's what we have to do. It may be temporary. Let's pray for that. That it's only a temporary thing. And we'll get back to normal business. We have to support the people that live in the city and this Mayor and this Council. There no other choices at this point. Thanks.

Joe Turik, 5119 East 131st Street. Good evening. I want to let it be known that I oppose this \$15.00 garbage fee that the Council and the Mayor want to impose upon us. Anytime you want to reach into somebody's pocket and pull out \$15.00 I think it ought to be put to a vote of the people. Let the people decide whether they want to pay this. This is kind of ridiculous, this taxation thing with people getting cuts from the auditors. You're going to be paying less and less taxes. That means less and less money for the city. This hasn't evened itself out yet. I think you ought to wait on this garbage collection deal and you shouldn't do it. I'm opposed to it 100%. Also a related subject, maybe somebody's going to jump on me and say don't talk about it. The camera red lights I understand that's already gone through, right?

PRESIDENT GERACI: Mr. Turik, you can't address that now at this point of the meeting. These are only agenda items.

MR. TURIK: As long as I'm up here might as well let me talk about it. I got bad legs.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Make it quick.

MR. TURIK: The camera things. \$100.00 for speeding through a red light. How many accidents is this going to cause if somebody is now aware he's going to get a ticket for going through an intersection? One of them kind that's questionable. Where the guy deserved it or not? And six cars behind him pile into one another and somebody gets injured? Maybe you? Maybe me? Maybe my Nancy over here? Anyone could get injured by that. I'd rather see these guys go through the red light than have one person get injured because of these screwball camera things. \$100.00 and \$33.00 goes to the guy who sold you the camera. That should be done away with. I guess it's too late to do that. You guys can well afford the \$15.00. All these \$100,000.00 a year guys. But a lot of these people out here can't afford it on Social Security.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Mr. Turik, could you wrap it up?

MR. TURIK: These people are living on \$1,000.00, paying \$200.00 a month taxes. Now you want to smack them with another \$15.00.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Turik. I appreciate it. Thank you.

Jerri Coyle, 13561 Foxcroft. I don't mind paying the garbage. I don't have the money, but I do have a daughter going to college next year but it keeps the police on the street keeping my daughter safe. I'm for it. Please keep our kids safe. It keeps the police catching drunk drivers and keeping them safe. They are our future. I applaud you guys for it. Even though I don't have the money I'm going to come up with it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Ms. Coyle.

Sally Templeman, 12813 Oak Park. Originally I was going to say that I was all for the garbage tax. I know Maple Heights has been doing it for years and I understand it needs to be one but then I did start going through the Performance Audit from August of 2009 and I just wonder if some of those things were done beforehand? Charging for garbage that you were supposed to be holding open meetings to the public at the time to let them know about the auditors are for it they said that you should get stakeholder involvement, the residents being the stakeholders. Next I'm wondering if they're actually monitoring the recycling program and checking to see what is recycled and what we're getting back from it. A monthly report showing the recyclable material collected and sold and also the cable and Websites are promoting the recycling of the items. For the collective bargaining units when they put the contracts did they negotiate to limit the number of sick days paid at retirement? Limit how many vacation sick days and personal days they received? According to many of the neighborhoods Garfield Heights does get quite a bit of those. More than most of them. The employees that were given a stipend for uniforms, they were supposed to turn in their receipts. Did they do that? I'm not saying anyone's dishonest but you know \$150.00 here, \$200.00 there they need to be accountable for it. The insurance premiums. They are supposed to pay 15% of their insurance premium. I'm wandering if they are? I've heard that they are now paying like a \$10.00 co-pay but I've not heard that they're paying 15% insurance premiums, which I know personally we pay \$250.00 a month. So to have someone who's not paying insurance premiums is basically unheard of in this day and age. Even the teachers' union had to break down and do that. Does the city have a formal purchasing policy? And purchasing procedures? They should have everything combined.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Ms. Templeman, could I remind you to stick to the agenda?

MS. TEMPLEMAN: I consider that to be part of the agenda. Resolution 13-2010.

PRESIDENT GERACI: You've got one minute to speak.

MS. TEMPLEMAN: I think that if these things aren't done I would say yes maybe we should but if they're not we need to look at them. Quickly in the last meeting like you said, Mayor, about 40% cut in pay I'm wondering is that actual cut in pay? Or are the new people hired on at a lower salary? I'm just asking. Does that include the PERS that the people who the city did pay for are paying out there own? Is that a part of that? I don't know that that's really being included. Are the people that were brought back receiving the benefits? If you retire and you did get retirement benefits for your health, etc. like Mr. McLaughlin's come back, is he receiving the benefits from retirement or a new set of benefits? These are just questions that we all need to know and everyone has sat back for so long that we have a room full of people that are finally starting to say enough is enough. That's why I understand all of you have a rough road ahead of you but I think that the things that were brought forward in the audit and they need to be done. If they're not done they should be done before you come back to us.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: If I may respond? A couple of things. You brought up quite a few but the ones I remember I'll come up with. Do you work for the schools?

MS. TEMPLEMAN: No. At Key Bank.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: OK. When I said there was a 40% giveback you are 100% right. 10% of that cut was the PERS. They gave up 30% of their wages. Can anybody in this room tell me if they've ever given up 30% of their wages? I knew Finnerty would raise his hand because he's on the Website. Anybody else? That's an unbelievable amount. Along with the 30% they took away their PERS which some people get paid and some people don't They were getting that paid. They pay for that out of their pocket now. That brought it up to 40%. They went from paying nothing on medical to paying emergency room, their

prescriptions were not costing a ton. Everything went up. They went from a Cadillac to a Pinto. Do you think that's a pretty good cut?

MS. TEMPLEMAN: As far as the benefits are their co-payments \$10.00? I know mine went up to \$25.00. I know some people who pay \$30.00.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: What is the emergency room now? \$25.00 and \$50.00 something?

MS. TEMPLEMAN: How much are their premiums?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: They don't pay premiums.

MS. TEMPLEMAN: Do they have deductibles?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I'm not arguing with you. What we really could do is we took 40% away. If we took 80% away we probably could really be doing good. When is enough enough? We can't keep going back to the same people. You want to know something? Not that I care and don't get it wrong and I know this is going on tape, etc. I took a \$50,000.00 cut in pay. \$50,000.00. That's quite a bit but the previous Mayor made a lot so I'm not arguing about that. On the cuts that were made there's nine people in this city that make more money than I do. Nine. I'm the Mayor. But that's because the staff took those cuts.

MS. TEMPLEMAN: But also I if may ask? Mayor Longo I don't know what he made but say he made \$150,000.00? And you came in at \$100,000.00? He has been here for 26 years not that I'm saying what he did was good. After being in here for a period of time that yes you're going to come in at a lower rate because you haven't been in here.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: But, we have people that are still there that took the cut.

MS. TEMPLEMAN: That's wonderful.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: But you're also saying we should take just a little more?

MS. TEMPLEMAN: I'm saying that they had the choice to stay there or join the how many unemployed people in Garfield Heights? I'm glad I've got a job. I thank God every day that I have job to go to.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Anybody else?

Maria Murphy, 4944 East 88th Street. I didn't come to speak on this but I would like to say this about the garbage in the spirit of community. Good idea is for all the people who are concerned about the Senior citizens and Veterans that maybe we should consider helping one another out and if you have a Senior citizen that cannot afford to pay the tax, maybe you should take her one or two bags of garbage? I certainly can't afford to pay \$15.00 but I will and I'll take my neighbor's garbage along with it if I have to.

That being said I am here to speak on the Ordinance for the cats 12-2010 that this lady was speaking earlier. There are alternatives. Nobody has educated the city of Garfield Heights about the alternatives. I have personally spayed and neutered cats that I trapped myself in traps at the APL for \$10.00 apiece and that's with shots and ear tipping which is the universal sign for a spayed or neutered animal. It can be done. We need to educate. You should not penalize the people who do spay and neuter their pets who keep them in the house and they don't get pregnant for the population. We are overrun with cats but we're all doing what we can. There are organizations. I'd be more than happy to talk with somebody about them. All you've to do is get on the Internet. You can get your pet spayed or neutered. I caught a dog the other day that I neutered and rehomed because nobody claimed him. That was \$40.00. If you guys want to get rid of the overpopulation of

cats, you don't penalize your citizens for it. You have it corrected and go with programs that will help citizens. It's out there.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Anybody else?

Clifford Kelly, 12312 Eastwood Blvd. You spoke about the convention center? Can we speak about that now?

PRESIDENT GERACI: No, that goes at the end. You can speak at the end about that. Thank you. Anybody else?

Carmen Drain, 5007 East 86th Street. I wan to address 13-2010. I am a mother of four and I would also like for all my kids some day to go to college. If I have to sit here and pay \$15.00 every month that is extremely high. OK? I also own a business where I already pay \$67.00 a month for garbage. OK? Also is there like a record of how many people live in Garfield? If you take that record and time that by 15 and 10 would you not give me a deadline on how much it will mean until we can stop paying the garbage? Who is responsible to pay for the garbage? Renters? Owners?

PRESIDENT GERACI: Owners.

MS. DRAIN: Only owners? That's not fair. I've been living in Garfield five years and it is extremely too much. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you.

Rose Lovano, 8595 Band Drive. I love you dearly Mr. Collova and I will do anything it takes possible to do in this city. I am a resident here almost 40 years. My corner, my home on 8595 Band Drive on East 86th is meticulous 24/7. Anyone else have anything to say about that? Here I am. I have maintained my home 22 year as a widow by myself. No help. I am not driving a Cadillac nor a Pinto. I have my feet on the floor. I have a lot to say. Don't give me five minutes please. I've never been ashamed to live in Garfield Heights. I hope it doesn't come to that. My husband and I have helped this community from schools, churches, whatever needed to be done, Council meetings, under the Longo Administration, Stachewicz, Holtz and now I hope to do the same for the Collova Administration. But this was not done right. I'm referring to the trash. You took a cut in medical insurance? As I stand here today 61 years old going to be 62. Look good for my age, thank you. And I have paid out of pocket from 18 years old my medical insurance. My husband didn't have it at his employment. I didn't have it at mine. to go to a doctor and pay out of pocket. I only receive Social Security. I'm not going to stand here and tell you all my finances because you would go bald. I am one of them that cannot pay. This was not handled right. I don't want to hear about that it was in the Neighborhood News because not everyone gets the Neighborhood News. They're not there when you go pick them up. People do banking at the window, have automatic transfer to their accounts. People don't go to grocery stores. I have to read this right now. From a 91 year old resident on Care Drive. I'm opening up in front of you. She'll be 92. She's got all her marbles. Looks good. She also maintains her property for 45 years. She wrote it and gave it to me to bring in to read:

“February 26, 2010

To the City of Garfield Heights. My name is Elena Kortovich, 8533 Care Drive. I am a resident of Garfield Heights for 45 years. I am 91 years old. I will be 92 years June 30, 2010. I cannot pay monthly or yearly for one tiny bag of rubbish pick up. I do not want this law of trash pick up.”

I saw you today at 6:10 on Channel 5 when I walked in the door and you looked mighty handsome behind that desk. I would like to see you behind that desk to address this to the public through Channel 5 about and publicize it about this trash pickup. I cannot pay \$15.00 which I think is way too high. There is not a community that pays \$15.00 a month. They pay \$9.00 or \$10.00 or whatever they pay. They do not pay \$15.00. I want to know where all the residents went? You have the ones that pay their taxes on time like myself and many others. But you can't continue to go to the same people and bleed them and we cannot continue to pay for those who do not pay. I believe in building up a community. I was proud to live in this

city. I never want to be ashamed to say I'm from Garfield Heights which years ago they called Garbage Heights but now what is it?

PRESIDENT GERACI: Ms. Lovano, are you getting close to wrapping it up?

MS. LOVANO: Soon.

PRESIDENT GERACI: I'd appreciate it. Thank you.

MS. LOVANO: I know, but I'm here for a while. All I got to say is it needs to be publicized. It needs to be reconsidered. I have a few options. I may be way off base.

CLMN VAUGHN: Mr. Geraci, I make a motion we give Ms. Lovano two more minutes.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Roll call on the motion.

CLWN MARINCIC: You going to keep it short?

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: Mrs. Lovano, please two minutes.

MS. LOVANO: I have suggestions. I may be off base. People with trash. I know there's sanitation rules and regulations. I also know that people have more trash in the summer including myself. Guilty. Than in the winter. Why can we not do a six month every week in the summer months; every two weeks in the winter months? I don't know if that's feasible? Have you looked into other trash haulers other than J&J? Maybe we need a new contract? Maybe we do not need five days a week to recycle? Maybe people can do their own recyclable? Or once a month let that truck come out one week out of the four weeks? There's ways to cut back? I may be wrong? I don't know? But I would like to have the people. If we're going to keep this city with pride and dignity, which my husband always was for and myself. Let's let the people vote on this. Please. I want to hear applause. To me it seems like it's a set done deal. April 1st it's going into effect. April 1st it's going to be billed through regional tax. Is that correct? Next year it goes on our house taxes, correct? You're saying we don't want to raise taxes. To me that's a tax raise. My home is one of the most expensive in this city. I'm not bragging.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Could you wrap it up please?

MS. LOVANO: Yes, I will. All I'm saying is that \$180.00 more on taxes. My house depreciated \$40,000.00. My taxes went up in December. There's no income. I live on Social Security. That's no lie. I can't pay this. I won't pay this. and I'm done. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mrs. Lovano.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Rose, before you leave, let me respond to a couple of those?

PRESIDENT GERACI: Would you be so kind as to sit down, though?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: First off I want to start off by saying you are 100% correct. You look great for 62 years old. OK? Let me explain to you a little bit about the notification so that people know what took place. In the past and there isn't anybody that comes to a regular meeting at this podium will tell you. In the past this would have been brought up on legislation, it would have been a three reading rule waiver, it would have been voted on, adopted in one meeting. The people would have heard about it on Friday. It would have been passed on a Monday. As a Council and as Mayor we don't want that. We want to make that the residents are aware of what's going on so let me tell you what we did. We did three readings so every meeting for three meetings this would be giving the people an opportunity to speak on it. We are putting this on our channel. It's on TV almost daily so people can see what's going on. It's been in the Neighborhood News for the three weeks/meetings whatever it works out. We have really taken steps to make sure that everybody'd be aware of what's going on. All of you will go back and tell your neighbors and hopefully that many more will be here next week. This was done not to buffalo anybody. We could have done this in one

reading. You'd be coming here saying you shouldn't have done it. There's been some great suggestions. As far as how we picked \$15.00 I would refer to Mr. Obert if I'm wrong but that was an average of the different cities that we talked about. From the numbers we have and I don't believe that they were not true because they were pretty reliable sources. That's how we arrived at that number. J&J is our refuse hauler because we take bids. They were the lowest one. We changed three times in the last 10 years because we go with the lowest hauler. I have to tell you at one of the Block Watches a lady brought up to me the fact that maybe we should have rubbish collected only every other week. This place would be filled with people saying they had rats. That's really stretching it there. We have really given this a lot of thought. This wasn't something that just came up. Recycling we are looking at that. I had a company come in and speak to me about recyclables. I have all the brochures, etc, and they can make us money and we will. The problem that we have it's hard for anybody to understand is why we are at this point a year after we went into fiscal emergency was because no action has been taken until now. The State, as of this morning, told us we have to do it now or they are going to lay off police and fire. We have to do it. That's what they're telling us. If we don't they will do it. So I would love to be able to say you know what Rose? And you know more than anybody else in here, you and I go back a long time and if I could do something to help Rose Lovano, I would, and I'm still going to try through Noreen,. What I'm saying is I don't have the option to say you know what? I feel sorry for her. We're not going to do it. Because tomorrow I have to tell the State we're not going to do it and next meeting I have everybody here saying we don't have enough police on the street because you had to lay them off. You have to understand this is not a choice I want to make. This is the lesser of the evils. If there's amendments that can be made about putting on something that says when we're back in the black we'll give it back, I have no problem doing that because that's my intention. We can do that if it's agreeable with Council. What I'm saying is there is no other avenue to take other than the three I said. I understand where you're coming from. Not only you. I've had people call me up crying on the phone that they can't even buy their medication. We're going to try to help everybody. We don't want to see anybody get in trouble in this. We know you all are. But this is to say that try something different, give this some time, give it more thought.

MS. LOVANO (*speaking from the audience*): Everyone has to pay. It's not the people that rent or Section 8. Section 8 comes right around back of us again. We pay that. The taxes are too high in this city. Always have been. Too high. We're getting nothing for our money. I'm sorry. Thank you, I hope we all pull together to come to a correct solution and I hope it's a good one for everyone. We must work together.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Rose.

CLWN MARINCIC: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Prokay, when everybody else is done I'll make a motion to give you another minute, OK?

Richard Schultz, 5213 East 100th Street. I know a lot of people don't like the idea of having to pay for their garbage pickup. I've lived and owned homes in other cities at the same time as I own a home here in Garfield Heights. I've paid as high as \$90.00 for every three months for rubbish pickup in other cities. \$15.00 a month is a drop in the bucket compared to what I've paid in the other cities. We had a house in Mentor. I had a house in Streetsboro. I had a house in Bainbridge. I was paying for my rubbish in all three cities. Fifteen years ago in Streetsboro I was paying \$90.00 for three months. First of all, and for the Seniors. I know it's going to be rough for the Seniors but there are programs out there to help the Seniors. If they are destitute for money there are programs. They do need to reach out and speak to whoever can help them. What the city's asking the Seniors to pay is \$2.50 a week for their trash. Maybe their next door neighbor can pay the \$2.50 for them? Other people mentioned other ways to avoid that. We cannot share garbage because that's not going to be the answer because you are trying to trick the system if you're trying to share your garbage with your neighbors,

Someone else also misunderstood the question about the duplexes. I'm not sure if that woman that was asking the question per household or was two families living in the same house? There's a difference between a duplex and two families living in the same house. I'm not sure what that question was. I think the

ordinance is going to be per household so a duplex is two households. The owner of the property is the one that will be paying that so usually one of the residences is rental property. He can pass that cost on to his renters or he can pick it up himself. I think that was misunderstood earlier and I'm not sure if that was addressed properly. Was your question for duplexes, ma'am? Two families living in the same house is not the same as. Those are duplexes. I'm sorry. A duplex to me is two residences because it has two addresses. That's two separate residences. Each one owns their own garbage cans. Each one has their own trash.

Please do not cut anything to do with the police and fire departments. I am a victim of crime. My little sister was murdered at the age of 13 years old. We cannot cut any safety in this city. Safety is not an option of cutting back. I believe that's all I have to say. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Point well taken, thank you, Mr. Schultz.

Steve Sanducci, 4762 Rockwood. What are we talking? \$15.00 a month? \$3.75 a week. Are we that poor? Come on. What does it mean? One less 12-pack of beer? Maybe a little less lottery tickets? Maybe a little less junk food? Or we can say we're not paying. We want everything to stay the same. Nothing's ever to change. We're living in an economic depression. Don't worry about it. Let the State take over. Then when we're getting home invasions and we don't have the money to pay the police to protect us you're going to see people up here complaining. For \$3.75 a week, they can't do it? Nobody can possibly be that poor. Thank you.

Jerry Primer, 8477 Band Drive. I work at Waste Management Recycle America. If we actually bagged up our own aluminum and maybe tin and had a drop-off point maybe if one person had one grocery bag of aluminum or tin and dropped it off say at the salt bin on McCracken? We make aluminum bales once a day that are over \$1,200.00. I load the truck with 40 bales of aluminum. If you actually donated one bag of aluminum every trash pickup from every household if possible you could probably make \$1,200.00 a month. by just contributing one bag of aluminum and recycling it somewhere. The city could actually recycle it themselves and eliminate the cost of the trash pick up by just scrapping your own aluminum or tin or whatever. A bale of tin is worth \$700.00. We load 40 bales of tin on a truck also. It's not very hard to do. J&J drops off. I see J&J almost every day. I know they pick up from Garfield. I've seen them 100 times where I work. It's very simple for us to just recycle aluminum or tin and we could eliminate the trash cost completely. It's easy for Waste Management to get rich doing the things that we could do on our own. It's very simple.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Jerry, if you can, if you give me a call or see me after the meeting I'd like to talk to you about this because this is something I don't know about. I'd like to hear more about it.

MR. PRIMER: I've watched trucks for J&J drop off. I've seen the truck come in. If we drop off one bag of aluminum like I said a small grocery bag. You picked up once a week. That's one grocery bag. That's \$4,800.00 a month by doing that. It's very simple.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Thanks, Jerry.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you for that point of information. We're going to hold off one second to change the tape.

CLWN MARINCIC: Mr. Chairman, I make a motion we take a ten-minute recess.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Roll call.

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

(The Meeting recessed for 10 minutes.)

PRESIDENT GERACI: Any comments from the audience? May I remind you to keep it to five minutes so we can vote on the agenda tonight?

Mary Ryan, 5014 East 114th Street. That would be nice. I sat and I listened to all of this for I don't know how long. What I don't understand. I'm willing to pay the money because I don't want to see police and fire reduced. People got on all the houses in Garfield Heights a reduction in the value of their home which made the taxes go down so I don't see how they can say they can't afford the \$15.00? If you tell them you can't afford it there's a reason. Get rid of your stinking cell phones that you pay \$50.00 or \$60.00 a month for and you could afford the \$15.00 so I don't know what they're complaining about. I'd rather pay the \$15.00 for a while. It's not forever. You said it wasn't forever so what are they complaining about? I don't understand it. If they didn't get a reduction in the taxes then they need to look into that.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Anybody else?

Dale Lindeman, 4772 Blythin. Mayor, I commend you on all the savings that you've done. I don't mind paying for the rubbish. This is not why I'm up here. You talked about all the savings, which is great, but what we didn't hear was. Usually with most Unions there's raises involved in contracts. I know this because I deal with a Union myself. Are there any Union raises coming next year that maybe should not happen?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: That's a good question, Dale. Actually they are under contract for Afscme, the police and fire do call for a raise this year. It's something that we're going to be talking to the unions about. They have given in this last go round, I don't have the figures in front of me, but it was in the area of \$200,000.00. They did give some money. I met with the Unions prior to putting the rubbish fee in front of Council and 95% of the Unions agreed that they would be willing to take additional concessions to help the city. So I think that at which time we need to go back to them I certainly would hope they would do that. We have not done it yet.

MR. LINDEMAN: I'm not putting you on the spotlight. This Ordinance 12 about the cats in the city. It's great. Limit it to three, but I have a problem with when I have to pay the County \$20.00 for my dog and you can have 95 cats in the house and not have one license. Why can't we make them put a license on these cats? That will solve your problems. When you got to pay \$20.00 for a measly tag. I know that's done by the County. Maybe the city can do something? Just my thoughts. Thanks.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Dale. Any other citizens?

CLWN MARINCIC: Mr. Chairman, I make a motion if no one else wants to speak that we give Mr. Prokay one more minute.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Roll call.

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

MR. PROKAY: The young lady over there, I'm sorry I don't remember your name. I wanted to make sure I talked to you when we had the break that not every Senior citizen with that program that she suggested looking into is eligible. I worked all my life and I'm not eligible for a lot of those things. So that's not true. It's not going to pay anything. Second thing is my son paid for this cell phone. Not me. And if you want to know how much medicine, etc. I take, fine. It's a simple fact that some people cannot afford this just like the lady was talking for the home where she lives. I don't want to see police and fire cut either, but you have to make tough decisions. Those decisions have to be made and it's not laying it on the backs to build Garfield Heights up. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Prokay. Anybody else?

Wendy Nixdorf, 10810 Penfield Avenue. I know I'm probably going to be in a large amount of trouble here, but I know my family we're not going to the movies as often. We're not going as often so I can assume that the city is running lean and mean with only things that we need. So rather than garbage, do we need to open the pool this summer? Do we need to have hockey for a year? What percentage of people in Garfield do those things versus people that don't? Yet we're all going to be paying the garbage fee. I know my family is not doing all the fun things that we do but it's only for a short time. Maybe one year of no pool. Maybe two

years? Maybe that's something to look at, but as a citizen I'm assuming you're looking at all possibilities. Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Anybody else?

Tom Chapin, 8505 Band Drive. I want to know how this \$15,00 a month is going to be collected? How are you guys going to bill for that?

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: For the month of April, May and June that quarter will be billed out at the end of June. Then we go July, August, September. That will be billed out in September. October, November, December will be billed out. The agencies that RITA recommended and they do the billing and the mailings. Then in September we have to pass an ordinance to have the special assessment set on for next year's real estate bills. You have two lists. There will be residential properties and the Homestead exemption. Ten dollars will be charged to the Homestead and \$15.00 will be charged for the families. That will come through your real estate bill which you probably will get in December. You have an option to pay. Say it's \$90.00. You have an option to pay \$90.00 or pay the entire bill for the entire year. That will become part of the tax duplicate which everyone failed to realize it's a city ordinance right now every year you have to re-submit it. It's not an automatic once it's passed it's there forever. On this one it has to be passed yearly. That's where we put in there that a yearly review will be made. So that was the check and balance on the garbage.

MR. CHAPIN: My question was you're saying we're going to be sent a bill in the mail?

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: For nine months this year you'll actually receive three bills. Next year you'll receive two bills and that will be done on the real estate bills.

MR. CHAPIN: OK. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Anybody else? Please keep it under five minutes.

Ron Finnerty, 8025 Garfield Blvd. Since this says it's going to be borne out by property owners are we going to be able to opt out of this program?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: No, you won't be able to opt out of it.

MR. FINNERTY: OK. Just for clarification it does say each residential unit. It's not house. It's residential unit so if it's a duplex it's each one. This fee is there anyway we could modify this ordinance so that conditional upon the voters being able to vote on it in November or as soon as possible election we could stop it? Because the voters don't want it. Is that something we can add in there? Because I heard a lot of people say they are not really in favor of it. This is an issue that should be brought to the voters. It should have been brought to the voters last year. The Council that didn't bring it up last year should have done it because garbage was being talked about last summer. This is not a new issue. It's just it's not publicized a lot around here. I'm glad to see people finally coming out. I'm in favor of it. I'll pay the \$180.00 a year. It's just I think every person in this city should have the right to decide if it's right for them.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I'm going to give you a couple answers. First of all I'm very glad to hear you're for it because you and I discussed this months and months ago long before I was elected about the rubbish fees. There's a couple of things. Let's say that first of all if we put it in front of the voters, we had the big election and we had to pay "x" amount of dollars to have this election and the residents turn it down? Let's say we go to option B. We reduce the tax credit. Bring it back in front of the residents. Pay all that money for an election? A year goes by. Six months. They turned it down. Next thing is the layoffs. Do we bring that in front of the people too, Ron? Do we do that? When will you say this has to be done and it has to be done now? I don't understand what you're missing here?

MR. FINNERTY: It's not what I'm missing. It's what this city and Council have missed for over a year and a half. These are issues that needed to be addressed a year and a half ago. We played around. We did nonsense. We didn't do the things we needed to do. We laid off people and you put some of them back in. You justified that maybe they'll save us money in the future. Maybe not?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: There's no maybe not. They will.

MR. FINNERTY: We do not need two directors for a Service Department that has less people than it had a year ago and a Rec Department that has less people than it had a year ago. Combine those two directors and guess what? We save over 100 grand. There's ways that we could really save money. As I said I'm willing to pay the garbage collection out of my pocket. I'm not willing to say that that is so for every other resident in the city. That's what this Council has asked to do. They're asked to say because people didn't do the things they should have done a year ago we're under crisis and something that you said today and I'm not trying to pick on you, I apologize, but something you said is if this doesn't go through the State will lay people off. I understand. I agree. I'm with you. What you neglected to say was what you said at Ward 3 Block Watch if this doesn't go through, the Tuesday before the State meeting you will lay people off. That hasn't been said to these people.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I'll say it now. Ron, I'm not trying to hide anything from anybody. What I'm saying is that I as Mayor of the city does not want nor does this Council, the State to come in and run this city. If they're going to come in and do layoffs, we'll do it, You're right. I said that 100%. And let me respond to some of the other things. If what the last Administration, what the last Council did, they did. What happened at City View happened. It's over. We can't go backwards. I'd love to be able to say let's go back in time and fix all this so that we don't have to be here today. I can't do that. I can't worry about the past, that's something you like to dwell on. All I can dwell on is the future. What do we do to get us out of the jackpot we're in right now? When that State comes in and talks to me this morning, I wish you could have been here and talked to me for 20 minutes about why we shouldn't be here. They don't care. We're here. We have to get out. I am the Mayor. I have to do something to get us out. This Mayor and this Council is put in this position to make decisions to save the city and those decisions are tough decisions. They are not easy ones to make. If somebody wants to ask me do I want to pay for rubbish. I certainly do not. I don't want to pay any more than they do. Garfield Heights is the fourth highest tax community in this county. We didn't have anything to do about it but it's reality. Nobody wants to pay a penny more. If I could I'd like to bring everybody back down and pay half the taxes they are. It's an impossibility. Just like what you're saying. We need to act now. I can't go backwards and get restitution from the people that didn't do what they should have done.

MR. FINNERTY: I understand. I'm just talking about this city operates in crisis mode for some reason. We're always up against the wall. That's how they passed the budget last year. They saw it without two days to think about it. That's just ridiculous. I applaud you for trying to get everybody to do the three readings. You can go to the Website. I said you should be applauded for that. You should be applauded for all those changes. I think you're doing a great job on some aspects, I think you have a rotten tough job because you were left a rotten tough job, but that doesn't mean we shouldn't go and let the people have some decision making.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: That's why the people are here and my door is open. Please find me an answer. And to respond to something else you said. You know you're 100% right. I could take the Service Director and take the Recreation Director, fire one of them and save \$100,000.00. I could take it a step further. I could take the police chief and fire chief, fire one and save another \$100,000.00. I could take the Law Director and the Building Director and fire one and I've saved \$300,000.00. You would applaud me and hopefully you'd put me on that Website of yours and say good job, Mayor, Right next to that tell me where do I get that other \$1.1 million? Because we're looking at a \$1.4 million deficit. That's what we're looking

at. The things that you come up with are things that we're doing on a daily basis. Nobody said why don't you get rid of the architect? Nobody said change your engineering practices. We have everything on the table and nobody's sacred. That's exactly what we're doing and we've come up with that much cuts. We've come up with almost \$4 million in cuts. That's a lot of money. We're \$1.4 million short and we can't get there by April.

MR. FINNERTY: I understand. That's why I said pass this bill and put it on the vote in November. That gives you six or seven more months to figure out some other solutions. But I don't think it's right to just drop it on everybody and say this is what's going to happen. A vote's necessary. I understand you've got a crummy situation.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Could you wrap it up?

MR. FINNERTY: I don't know if that's the answer without letting them decide if it's OK for them?

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Ron. Anybody else? Anybody else?

COMMITTEE REPORTS: None.

PRESIDENT GERACI: We'll now move on to the Ordinances and Resolutions.

ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS:

ORDINANCE NO.: 12-2010

AN ORDINANCE ADOPTING SECTION 505.26, OF CHAPTER 505 ANIMALS AND FOWL OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS RELATIVE TO THE MAXIMUM NUMBER OF CATS PERMITTED WITHIN THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS.

Moved by MARINCIC to PASS ON SECOND READING:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes.

ORDINANCE NO.: 13-2010

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE ADOPTING SECTION 913.08 OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS RELATIVE TO THE COST OF GARBAGE, WASTE, RUBBISH AND REFUSE COLLECTION.

Moved by MARINCIC to PASS ON SECOND READING:

AYES: 4

NAYS: 1

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: Four Yes. One No. That passes.

ORDINANCE NO.: 18-2010

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A PURCHASING PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT WITH THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, FOR THE PURCHASE OF SODIUM CHLORIDE (ROCK SALT), FOR THE 2010-2011 SEASON.

Moved by SARNOWSKI to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes.

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

RESOLUTION NO.: 10-2010

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION APPOINTING MARGARET SIKON TO THE GARFIELD HEIGHTS TAX INCENTIVE REVIEW COUNCIL

Moved by SUSTER to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

RESOLUTION NO.: 11-2010

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION APPOINTING ELVING OTERO TO THE GARFIELD HEIGHTS TAX INCENTIVE REVIEW COUNCIL.

Moved by SARNOWSKI to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

CLWN SARNOWSKI: I'd like to make an amendment to Resolution 11-2010. I'd like to take out the word Elving Otero in the title and in the third Whereas and put in Carol Cieplowski.

VOTE ON THE AMENDMENT AS STATED.

AYES: 4

NAYS: 1

ABSENT: 2

CLWN MARINCIC: I'd like to offer another amendment. In Section 1 it also says Elving Otero and I'd like to change that to the name Debbie gave.

VOTE ON THE AMENDMENT AS STATED.

AYES: 4

NAYS: 1
ABSENT: 2

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: 4
NAYS: 1
ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes four Yes, one NO.

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: Mr. Chairman, Point of Order. That did not pass as an emergency resolution.

PRESIDENT GERACI: You need five on that?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: You need five.

PRESIDENT GERACI: OK. So that didn't pass.

RESOLUTION NO.: 12-2010

A RESOLUTION BY THE MAYOR AND COUNCIL ON BEHALF OF THE RESIDENTS OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS HONORING THE MEMORY OF MARTHA T. KAPLA AND EXTENDING SINCERE CONDOLENCES TO HER FAMILY.

Moved by MARINCIC to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

CLWN MARINCIC: Before I vote, I'd just like to say that Marty Kapla was a dear woman. She lived in Ward 2. She was always there available to help people and I felt free to call her and ask her how she felt on issues and she will be dearly missed in this community. I vote Yes.

AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

RESOLUTION NO.: 13-2010

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION DIRECTING THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS TO APPLY FOR A PARKS & PLAYGROUND INITIATIVE GRANT FOR THE REVITALIZATION OF PLAYGROUNDS.

Moved by SUSTER to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

RESOLUTION NO.: 14-2010

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION DIRECTING THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS TO APPLY FOR GRANT FUNDS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF COMMUNITY GARDENS.

Moved by MARINCIC to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: 5
ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0.

CLWN SARNOWSKI: Mr. Chairman, I have a question to the Law Director. Since Resolution 11 was an emergency so it had four votes so according to our previous Law Director it passes as a non-emergency. Is that correct?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: Passes as what?

CLWN SARNOWSKI: As a non-emergency and it takes effect in 30 days.

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: Yes, that would be correct. So it would be effective in 30 days. It passes like a normal. What you did is you waived the three readings so you don't have to have the three readings. In order for it to pass as an emergency you would have needed five but since it went four it's not an emergency and our ordinances go in effect 30 days after they are passed so four is enough to pass it to go into effect in 30 days.

CLWN SARNOWSKI: So in effect Resolution 11 did pass, but it will take effect in 30 days?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: Yes. As I said it did not pass as an emergency resolution.

CLWN MARINCIC: Mr. Chairman, I also have a question for our Law Director on the trash ordinance. It only passed with four votes. Did that pass with only four votes?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: Yes, because you're doing the three readings on that and that passed with the majority of Council to go on to the third reading. OK? So, basically at the third reading if it would go 4-0 or 4-3 or whatever, but not the 5 as required for an emergency then it would go into effect in 30 days. If you have 5 votes on a third reading it would go into effect immediately because it's an emergency.

CLWN MARINCIC: OK. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Anybody else?

COMMENTS BY CITIZENS:

PRESIDENT GERACI: We'll move on to Comments By Citizens. The rules are you cannot bring up anything of a first nature. You must have previously brought a problem to a Councilperson or a City Hall department. You are limited to speak only once for a period of five minutes. Please raise your hand to be recognized. Here we go.

Clifford Kelly, 12312 Eastwood Blvd. I have two points. One about the convention center. Giant Eagle is playing the bully and not allowing Garfield to go with the convention center. My question is, explain to me again this contract dispute and why we can't go ahead anyway. Did Giant Eagle say if you go ahead with it we will pull out? Or what's the situation with that?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: The problem is the contract is between Giant Eagle and the developer which is in the hands of a Receiver right now. We are not a party to that contract. We don't have standing to do anything regarding that contract. So whatever goes on with that contract is going on between the Receiver and Giant Eagle. My understanding of the contract is that Giant Eagle has the right to refuse a non-retail business if it moved into the area. That's part of the contract and it's not uncommon in that business. What exactly took place in the negotiations I'm not sure but Giant Eagle had that option in their contract.

MR. KELLY: OK. Is anyone from the city have you been able to contact this Receiver and find out what your options are as far as this convention center is concerned?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: They were very specific about what my options were if I didn't follow them. My option was to keep my mouth shut and let it go on. That's sort of being a little bit strong but basically what they're saying is that if we do something let's say I was to say let's do a boycott, which and I have said and stated before that's the last thing I want to do because we want Giant Eagle to stay. But if we were to do something like that Giant Eagle would be able to escape their clause, leave City View and go elsewhere. So the Receiver, he's a Court-appointed Receiver, has been very cautious with what I say. Quite honestly, I'm pushing the envelope by what I said tonight but I wanted everybody to know what was going on because Giant Eagle is saying one thing. Some of the show people are saying another thing. I wanted everybody to be aware of what happened. So actually our options have been met and hopefully not over exceeded.

MR. KELLY: So this convention center idea. Is it a done deal? We cannot do it at all?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I was privy to an e-mail that went back and forth that was not intended for me but I ended up with a copy of it that said that the Receiver said it's not dead. It may be resurrected later this year.

MR. KELLY: Second point. I'll make it quick. The last time I was here I asked something about some type of decency rule. I did some paperwork. It's my understanding that there is a suburb maybe in the Northeast area who is also considering the same thing if they have not already done it about the saggy pants, and just your dress in the city. Where are we with that? I know you got a lot of stuff going on with the rubbish but have you had a chance to look at that?

LAW DIRECTOR TIMOTHY RILEY: I think we sent over some of the documents that we found over to you through your Councilwoman. The problem is enforceability. I think you'd pick that up if you read any of that? I have not heard of a local community that's doing it. If there is one and you know of it I would be more than happy to talk to the Law Director and find out how they're planning on doing that.

MR. KELLY: It's doable because here in the United States it's being done. I'm sorry that this is becoming an issue now but I already told my children, if I ever see you looking like this, I'm going to get you right where you're standing. I don't care who you're with. I'm sorry that other parents are not taking the same forceful issues on their children's dress but as citizens of Garfield or just citizens period, you're paying taxes I bet you have a right to say what you want to happen in your city. We have a voice. I think we got to move on this. Anything I can help you with is fine. I'm willing to do it. Just ring me up.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: If I may, after the last meeting it was the very next day that the Law Department looked into all the different areas that were doing something about this ordinance with baggy pants, etc. We had quite a few documents. We're looking through them. We found out whenever realized it goes beyond boys. It's also women, girls. It's quite extensive with the different things. Unless it was really narrowed down to some specifics it would be almost impossible to enforce or we'd be grabbing almost every kid off the street. We did look into it. We haven't given up on the idea. We will continue to work with it.

MR. KELLY: Thank you.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Kelly. Anybody else?

David Mays, 8250 Green Drive. Mayor, last meeting you said something about I gave all the Council people candy. Well, I said yes to that. I was wrong. I did not give all the Councilmen candy. I gave the women up there candy. Now if you would like me to include you in this group, please let me know and I will be glad to.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Dave, if I may, when it comes to chocolate, you can call me Mrs. Collova. Just give me a piece.

MR. MAYS: By the way, I did give your wife some candy but you can't have any.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Mays. Anybody else?

Dale Lindeman, 4772 Blythin. Mayor, I know you said you don't want to do a boycott against Giant Eagle. I last week sent Giant Eagle an e-mail telling them I'm no longer going to be a customer for what they're doing in the city which I call home. I hope everybody here feels that way? If you think you're saving money by shopping there and getting Fuel Perks let me tell you. You're way off. Giant Eagle I believe is crippling this city by doing what they did. I forwarded a copy of the e-mail to my Councilman. I believe he forwarded it to the rest of Council. I said what I felt. I think if we all stand up, maybe not go up there and protest, but if we stopped shopping up there, maybe we can send them a message? Remember they're from Pittsburgh.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Dale, if I may, my sentiments are much like yours, but I think it's important that we let Giant Eagle know our displeasure, but at the same token if we boycott the place and force them out of business we're not only getting Giant Eagle, we'll get everybody else that's in that center because they are too small to survive without the Giants. That's the reason that I have really toned down my feelings towards Giant Eagle. I do believe that anybody that walks in the store by all means say I think what you did was a rotten trick.

MR. LINDEMAN: We should do that to the manager?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I have no problem with that at all. The manager is well aware of what went on. I think it's important that we keep them there.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Dale. Anybody else?

Kelley Schultz, 5213 East 100th Street. I happen to work for the largest real estate investment trust company in the country. Developers Diversified. They specialize in shopping centers. A couple things I want to say

and I agree with the Mayor. If you boycott this store they will move. They have every right to move because the developer breached the contract when he did not finish the road. Their contract I'm sure included the specifics as to how that center was going to fall out. The minute that is changed they can move. They can choose to stay but now they have a loophole to always leave. So if we decide to boycott them they're going to pull. They don't have to stay. We're going to lose them. I have the name and address of the CEO of Giant Eagle. You need to write letters. You need to start a campaign but don't threaten them. You need to let them know that what they did was wrong. You need to let them know the economic effects it had on all of us. But the Mayor's absolutely right. If Giant Eagle pulls out every small store up there is going to be gone because there's nothing left. Noting to pull them. Giant Eagle's a pull. Not just from our community but from other communities. Write the letter to the CEO. I have the address. Unfortunately I didn't bring it with me tonight. You can go on the Website. Type on the computer CEO of Giant Eagle. It will give you his name, address. Send the letter to him. Don't send it to someone lower. Talking to the store managers are great but it won't go above the store managers. That's not how it works. Giant Eagle is not that big of a company when it comes to actual shopping centers. They have 158 stores which in the scheme of things is not that big. Send a letter, let them know what you're thinking. Don't be violent. You can express your anger. Don't threaten to boycott because they will pull that store and they will not think twice about it. That's how they do business. Most retailers are like that. I do think it's unfair that they've held us hostage. I have not seen the lease. You have a Law Director that knows more about law than I do. I checked the leases that we had with Giant Eagle and there's nothing in them specific but every landlord has their own leases. They may have something totally different. There was nothing in there and withholding it on condition. There is no way that us as a landlord would have put up with that but not seeing the lease I don't know. Write a letter, get your neighbors to write a letter, but don't boycott them because they'll leave. Thank you.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: If I may, before you leave, if you would call me please and let me know the name, address, etc. I'll make sure everybody gets it.

MS. SCHULTZ: Yes.

Mildred Whitmore, 13154 Forestdale. I would like to ask Mr. Obert a question. When Henry Warren was on Council he was labeled a radical and couldn't get along with Council because he kept telling us this was going to happen. Every time he brought it up, Mr. Obert and the Mayor assured us that the city was in good shape. If we were in good shape why are we in the shape we are in today?

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: If you could tell me what triggered the mortgage foreclosures in the United States? The answer what happened over here with our economy and the number of people that are really laid off. About 20%. They don't count the people that are off after six months. You had the perfect storm. Henry clairvoyantly I worked with the man. He was saying about the debt borrowing. It's never been a problem us paying back any of our bonds or our notes in the 27 years I've been here we made our schedules. It was the cash dollars. RITA last year we lost \$1,551,000.00. On the real estate side try \$1.2 million in non-collectibles. People just didn't pay it. Right now our ratio is about 12%. When those two factors were added together then you get into the mortgage foreclosures which at one time we had almost 1,400 vacant homes out of 10,600 that's a pretty good percentage. All these disasters. Then we get the back door all that going on in the economy right? We have a methane issue over there. Everyone kind of forgot about that. That was the real reason people vacated. That was a loophole in their leases over there. The extraction plant still isn't built as far as I know. You take what a Wal-Mart was worth. We went through all the personal property, the profits tax, the employees' hourly payroll taxes, took out 61 homes for a mud field I think we have up there with an Aldi's in the middle and no way of getting to it. Plus three businesses that were doctor-related. There were over \$323,000.00 we received and I had that documented from RITA. It was on profits tax and also on payroll taxes. The salaries were outrageous over there. All this added together, how do you overcome it? The Mayor basically answered it. We did. \$4.2 million is what we cut. We're done with that. The auditor's question as the Mayor kept saying what are you going to do because now we're on a projection to lose another million dollars in income tax. It was \$222,000.00 for two months. Could be over one million. What are you going on to do? They call it a rainy day fund. We could call it a balance in your appropriation you didn't spend. You under appropriated our budget. We have a balanced budget right now.

You heard the Mayor if you guys were at the meeting with the State? It isn't going to stay balanced because of one factor. To get out of the dilemma you have to go five years. Right now we have \$2.5 million in cash, we have no red accounts in the city at all. It ain't going to stay that way. By the end of this year they're projecting another million dollar loss. What are you going to do about it? It keeps getting worse and worse. Nobody has a crystal ball. They said you have to infuse \$2 million from some revenue source or really just cut the hell out of the people. I'm leaving in a couple weeks, people, you won't have to deal with me no more, Listen to this. I started here. I had eight full-time people and one part-time statistical typist you go back to the 80s when they didn't have computers. My department was cut 59% in people. It got so bad my last girl standing quit two weeks ago. I can't take this. We're down to 70%. You can't operate \$55 million to \$60 million with all the different paperwork and reports we've got with two people. People out here think, why not? Work harder. Well you'll pretty soon be down to one person so good luck. That's my answer, ma'am.

MRS, WHITMORE: Thank you. And another thing I want to say. Since we've been subsidizing the rich with their electricity for over 40 years, why don't we start getting a petition and call our State Representative to Congress and see what we can do about that? I don't think this is fair. No one knew that we were subsidizing the rich for 40 years.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you. Anybody else?

Joe Turik, 5119 East 131st Street. Everybody in the city got big pay cuts—firemen, policemen all got 40% pay cuts. My gosh. That still doesn't balance the budget. Maybe if they had taken a 45% cut that would have balanced it? I have favor to ask of Mayor Collova. I want to help you. I see the situation you're in. You're looking for help. How to balance the budget. We all want to balance the budget. If you could submit to me or maybe some other person brighter than I a listing of the employees. How much they make. How much they made five years ago. What kind of benefits. How many sick days, etc. Every dollar that's spent on everybody in this city and let us study this together. We will come up with where must we cut? How much does the Chief of Police make? Does he make \$120,000.00? \$130,000.00? I hear you cut him so he's down to about \$80,000.00 now?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: What we did was we cut the staff down 40%. Union people, police, fire, Afsme gave up clothing allowances, efficiency allowances. They gave up other things that led to a certain amount of money that our negotiators thought that they had to give back.

MR. TURIK: Did they take a pay cut?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: No, Sir, they didn't.

MR. TURIK: So the police and firemen did not take a pay cut? I was under the impression they all got pay cuts?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: No, Sir.

MR. TURIK: Well, that throws kind of a new light on the whole subject. Can I get Mr. Obert to send me a form on who makes how much? How many \$120,000.00 guys there are? What they were cut if they were cut? They weren't cut according to the Mayor.

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: I don't think you heard me, Mr. Turik. We have no payroll department. My associate in here left. The girl that used to do it walked out of here. I have nobody,

MR. TURIK: You have no pay? So you can't furnish us?

FINANCE DIRECTOR RICHARD OBERT: I don't have the data right now.

MR. TURIK: So this is kind of a situation. How to figure this out? We have firemen, policemen, other employees. We don't know how much they're getting. Is that what you're saying?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: We know exactly how much they're getting. It would take me some time to get it for you because our payroll department right now is turned upside down. They might not be able to

meet payroll next week but I don't think that will be a problem for you because that would be an additional way to save money, but right now we're worried about making payroll with two people and the only person that and that was our fault for not cross-training, the only person that knows how to do all of the different aspects of the payroll quit without training anybody. So right now we got our hands full. We got people coming in trying to show us how to do things. I'd be more than happy to bring you to the Finance Department, give you a key and let you look at everything you want but right now we can't do that.

MR. TURIK: So right now we don't know who's making how much?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: I can tell you how much I make , Sir. That's about it.

MR. TURIK: We are in a sad shape, maybe you better hope for that State to come over here and take over?

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Joe, once I tell the State that you got the answers, they'll be happy to talk to you.

MR. TURIK: If I have the information before me who's making how much.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: You'd be able to decide how much they should make, right?

MR. TURIK: You got to look at it realistically. Can we afford to pay this guy this money? Or can we not? Do we have to take a pipe test? These people here are those meeting I guarantee you they all took pay cuts.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Joe, you and I talked about this on the phone. They have taken a 40% cut. Obviously you told me about that before. You told me about volunteer police and fire would save us a lot of money too.

MR. TURIK: Sure.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: We could probably do that but we have to give it some thought. Thank you, Joe.

MR. TURIK: Nobody here knows how much the chief makes? Is that what you're saying? Where's my Ward 2 Nancy? How much does the Chief of Police make?

CLWN MARINCIC: He made a little more than Longo did, didn't he? Around \$110,000.00 a year. That's my guess. I'm not going to swear to it.

MR. TURIK: So you don't know either?

CLWN MARINCIC: That's a pretty good guess.

MR. TURIK: Mike, you have an answer for me?

CLMN NENADOVICH: No, Sir.

MR. TURIK: Who knows? Nobody knows how much he makes.

MAYOR VICTOR COLLOVA: Joe, tomorrow morning call me and I'll tell you how much the janitors and everybody makes. I don't have it on me right now. I'm sorry.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Turik. Your time is up. Thank you. Anybody else wishing to speak? Anybody else?

Richard Schultz, 5213 East 100th Street. Everybody can voice their opinion and do whatever they want. What we really need is for everybody to come together and help the city. I was in the landscaping business and I did foreclosed properties. I've told Mayor Collova that I will volunteer my services to help the program he's trying to get started for doing the foreclosed properties, cutting the grass and billing so the city will make

money off of it. I volunteered my services and I'll be there to help get anything you need to get started and how to make it very successful very fast. Anyone else that has ways that they can help the city instead of complaining about what the city's not doing step forward, man up, let's get this city back on its feet. The faster the city's on its feet, the faster we can have lower taxes, better amenities and we'll enjoy living here. Thank you. Good night.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Schultz. One minute.

Rose Lovano, 8595 Band Drive. I am also volunteering my services. I have a CDL. I can drive any vehicle in the yard. Even the snowplows. I'm a hairdresser and I can also do that and I'm a math major and I can help with the budget. I volunteer as many hours. No pay. Call me.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Ms. Lovano. Mr. Prokay, keep it short, please.

Steve Prokay, 9801 Sladden Avenue. Yes, I will. Thank you, Frank. I just wanted to point out on the data central that our school system and this is for the benefit of our students tonight, that the amount of taxes that we pay for the schools is \$1,338.00. The amount of taxes that the city of Garfield Heights collects is \$879.00. Our school system is rated 15 out of 30 standards. I'm not picking on the school system but I think we need that our city is in such a deep mess to not be able to work to get the funding instead of keep reissuing levies that were passed. I think it's time the city needs help too that what we have to do is not renew them and try to shift some of the money to the problem with the city. I don't know if everybody's aware of those figures but it's in the Cleveland Plain Dealer. Thank you, Frank.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Mr. Prokay. Anybody else? Anybody else? We'll move on. Miscellaneous Business. Clwn Marincic?

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS:

CLWN MARINCIC: First and foremost I would like to thank everybody who came out tonight. It never fails to amaze me the more people you get together the better ideas you get. Fifty minds--that's amazing and I want to thank you and tell you how much I appreciated it. I want you to take back to the schools and let them know what Mr. Prokay said, OK? You got to do some work here tonight. I don't think we could afford to cut our schools either. Honestly they're getting by on the minimum right now and I don't want to encourage anybody to vote against that renewal that's coming up. But you will pass it along won't you? I think that's all I have tonight. Good night everybody and thank you for coming out.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you, Councilwoman.

CLMN NENADOVICH: Yes, I'd like to thank everybody also for coming out tonight and thank you for your comments. I really appreciate it. It does shed a different light on a lot of things and with that I have nothing else.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you.

CLMN VAUGHN: I have a lot this evening. No, I have some good news. At the corner of Hathaway and Turney Road we have a new company moving in. H&D Landscaping. They're going to be fixing up the lot. They're going to fix up the building and they'll be selling seasonable items. It's owned by Brenda and Jim Monaco. They live over on Hathaway. They're really going to fix up the place. So when they start up, stop in and say hello, introduce yourself. The other thing I have for this evening and then I'm going to wrap this up is I want to say thanks to our students Nicole and Joanna. This was really a great meeting to start out at. We look forward to seeing you more often. Mr. Geraci, one more thing, I'd like to make a motion that we adjourn.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Roll call.

CLWN MARINCIC: You did a great job tonight, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT GERACI: Thank you.

AYES: 5

ABSENT: 2

PRESIDENT GERACI: That passes 5-0. The next Meeting will be on March 22nd at 7 p.m. Meeting adjourned

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:37 p.m.

APPROVED:

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

Frank J. Geraci, Jr.
President of Council

Barbara Molin
Clerk of Council